

Percival de la Rocque
Green Mantle Herald
(Keith Crawley)
556 Maple Ave.
Burlington Ont.
L7S 1M6
crawley@worldchat.com

Ealdormere Commentary Letter 13 January 2004

The following are the commentary notes regarding the December 2003 Internal Letter of Intent. The commentary meeting was held on 13 January 2004 at the Royal City of Eoforwic.

As previously stated I have deleted the emblazoned miniatures from this letter as they are available for cross reference in the Internal Letter...

- 1. Baudouin de Domrémy** (New Name and Device) Seeks a male name for 1400 to 1500 French language and culture. Submitter Will Not accept major changes.

Or a lion segreant gules maintaining a fluer de lis azure, on a chief vert a straight trumpet fesswise bell to dexter Or.

Submitter gives us the Dictionary of the Middle Ages (copies attached) Strayer I. & Reese, Joseph. as the sole source of support for both name elements with the story that his persona is the son of a Belgian trader (Baudouin is a Belgian name) who settled in Doremy France.

Baudouin PG. 567 states one of the subjects in a painting by Jan Van Eyck 1390-1441 as "Among the many interesting people that he records so accurately are officials at court (Baudouin de Lannoy)"

Domrémy PG 114. Quotes "Joan of Arc, St. (ca.1412-30 May 1431) born at Domrémy, "

**Commentary felt the supplied documentation was a little weak and Brand came up with a citation from Jojville and Vaillancourt's "Chronicles of the Crusades and we have added this ti the External letter and passed this item up to Laurel.

Also in commentary it was noted that the device contained a complexity count of 8 that put it right on the line for complexity. However most people also felt it was a well carried out design and did not look overly busy or complex. We have passed this on to Laurel for a definitive ruling.

- 2. Conall Cailech** (New Device) Name was registered Jan 1996 via the Middle.

Per bend sinister azure and argent, on a cock to sinister an annulet all counterchanged.

** No conflict was found and the device was found to be sufficiently period and within the rules we passed this on to Laurel.

- 3. Elaina of Oaklawn** (New Badge) Name was registered in June 1981 via Atlantia

(fieldless).On an oak leaf argent a panther rampant sable incensed gules.

**No conflict was found in commentary. One commenter found the Oak Leaf to be lacking in terms of representing an actual Oak Leaf. We will pass this on to Laurel for a ruling and suggest the submitter be instructed to draw the leaf in a more realistic manner.

- 4. Gareth Cambell** (New Name and Device) Seeks a male name with no stated time period or culture. Will not accept any changes.

Per chevron gules and sable, three unicorn heads and on a chief embattled Or three thistles proper.

Documentation states "<Gareth> Withycombe dates Gareth to 1593. The name was given to a child baptised at Wigan on that date. s.n. Gareth" And "<Cambell> Duncan le Cambell is dated to 1447 in Reaney & Wilson, s.n. Campbell. The only attached documents are Pensic worksheets.

**For the name no conflict was found and as both name sources cited are Appendix H we will forward this to Laurel.

This device also contains 8 elements (9) if the two tinctures of the thistle (vert leaves, Purpure flowers). However we again feel this is not an overly busy or un-period looking device. Asingle

commenter also said the chevron was too low (below the Per Fess line, However the picture clearly shows the tip of the chevron above this line and we also feel this makes the chevron and unicorn heads fit together well in an overall period and balanced style. We will pass this to Laurel again for a definitive ruling.

- 5 Isabella Vannicelli** (New Device submission) Name registered June 2003 via Ealdormere.

Quarterly argent and azure a seawolf rampant sinister counterchanged.

**No conflict was found and over all the device is very attractive. We changed the blazon from "Rampant" to "Errect" as we felt a creature with only 2 legs cannot be rampant. Passed on to Laurel.

- 6 Margaret Brodie** (New Name and Device Submission) Submitter seeks a female name authentic to 12th century Scotland and cares mostly about the language/culture.

Azure upon a bend argent two bears statant erect sustaining axes sable. **submission contained no blazon and the above is my impression based on the colour copy of the device form. A better blazon is sought.

Documents for the names Margaret site the Cambridge Historical Encyclopedia of Great Britain & Ireland and the Facts on File Dictionary of First Names (Dunkling & Gosling) no dates are sited but the copies do give dates for Margaret c 1046-93 Queen consort of Malcolm III Canmore . . . Copies are attached.

For Brodie, A Dictionary of Surnames (Hanks & Hodges) and Collins Encyclopedia of Scotland. Copies attached. Both documents make mention of Brodie Castle Nr Forres Moray. The only mention of dates is quoted "Brodie castle has been in possession of the same family, the Brodies since it was first built, perhaps as early as the 12th century".

** Commentary added documentation as follows. Margaret "Wythicombe pg 207". Brodie "Reany Pg 49 under the header Michael de Brothie from 1311". The name will be passed up to Laurel.

The Device however was found to be in conflict with "Andrea de Champs de Batailles, Nov 79 via the West, Azure, on a bend argent a unicorns head palewise coupé sable between two cinquefoils purple." There is only a single clear difference for the changes to the Tertiary charges upon the bend.

The device will be returned for conflict.

- 7 Margaret Brodie** (New Badge Submission) Name submitted as item #6 on this letter.

Argent within a bordure azure a bear statant erect holding an axe sable. **once again the submitter provided no blazon and we seek an accurate blazoning for this badge.

** This badge was also found to be in conflict with "Berlin, City of, Argent, a bear rampant sable. Registered by the COA as protected significant mundane heraldry. June 1995 via Caid." A single Difference for the Bordure none for the sustained axe. And with "Barra Dubh Fitzedward, Argent, a bear rampant to sinister sable within a bordure azure. Dec. 1990 via the West. Single difference for the posture/direction the bear faces and again nothing for the axe.

Returned for conflict.

- 8 Malachi Blacksley** (New Name and Device) Submitter seeks a male name and cares most about the sound and gives no preference for culture/language.

Argent three rapiers in pall points to center gules between three crows, one and two displayed sable a bordure sable with hops or.

The name documents are attached copies Whithycombes pg #90. Baptismal and Confirmation names Edward F Smith 1935. With "Malachy (Malachias, æ) B.C. Nov.3.R.M. 12 cent" also History of Christian Names Charlotte M. Yonge. Pg 52 "Malachi would never have been a modern name, but for the Irish fancy that made it the equivalent of Maelseachlainn the disciple of St. Sechnall. . . . Gaelic Personal Names, O Corrain & Maguire PG. 131. "better known as Malachy. It was one of the commonest names in the later middle ages" Also included is Names and Naming Patterns in England 1538-1700 by Scott Smith-Bannister that has several

reference points supporting use of Old Testament Biblical names.

There is no supporting documentation for the name Blacksley .

**Commentary produced the following to document Blacksley . Reaney pg. 34 "William de Blakley 1301." We have forwarded this name to Laurel with the possible recommendation of a change to Blakley if no support can be found for Blacksley.

The device was returned for a redraw as commentors felt that a number of problems existed with the emblazoned drawing. A) the Bordure was far too narrow, B) the crows are not well defined as anything other than "a bird of some sort". C) The Hops are too small to be clearly identified as anything at all. D) the swords touch the bordure and again are somewhat small to be clearly identified.

Return for redraw.

9 Rising Waters, Barony of (New Award Name) "**Award of Fiona's Pebble**"

**Will not accept major changes. Wish the award name to be authentic for "historical reference"

The award of a single pebble will be given to children giving service to the Barony and the Kingdom.

Fiona - the award is named in honour and memory of the founding Baroness of Rising Waters Fiona Averylle O'Connor of Maidenhead (White Mantle Herald Extraordinaire) Patron of the children.

Pebble- as per period construction -Order of the Holy Vial (France, 492) Saint Michael's Wing (Portugal 1147) and attached examples "A Collection of Period Order Names" found at www.nwlink.com/~badger/sca/ordernames.html)

**The documentation supplied does not support the award as a "Persons Name(Fiona) + Object (Pebble)". It is felt that a "Group name (Order) + Holy Relic (Holy Vial)" and a "Angelic Being (St Michael) + Body Part (Wing)" are not sufficiently similar to the "Name + Object" as submitted and no other documentation was put forth in commentary to support awards named for a "Person + Object"

We have returned this for insufficient documentation.

10 Rising Waters, Barony of (New Award Name) "**Award of Fiona's Pearl**"

**Will not accept major changes. Wish the award name to be authentic for "historical reference"

The Award of a single Pearl will be given to children displaying effort in the arts and sciences.

Fiona - the award is named in honour and memory of the founding Baroness of Rising Waters Fiona Averylle O'Connor of Maidenhead (White Mantle Herald Extraordinaire) Patron of the children.

Pearl- as per period construction -Order of the Holy Vial (France, 492) Saint Michael's Wing (Portugal 1147) and attached examples "A Collection of Period Order Names" found at www.nwlink.com/~badger/sca/ordernames.html)

**The documentation supplied does not support the award as a "Persons Name(Fiona) + Object (Pebble)". It is felt that a "Group name (Order) + Holy Relic (Holy Vial)" and a "Angelic Being (St Michael) + Body Part (Wing)" are not sufficiently similar to the "Name + Object" as submitted and no other documentation was put forth in commentary to support awards named for a "Person + Object"

Returned for Insufficient documentation.

11 Ruaidhrí Clàrsair (New Name & Device) Submitter does not care about the gender of the name (is aware this is a male name) but wishes the name to mean Red Harper **Will not accept Major Changes.

Argent a harp gules and a bordure sable.

Ruaidhri- O Corrains Irish names P 158

Clarsair- Blacks Surnames of Scotland pg 153 (galeic form meaning harper)

No copies of documents were provided except for Pensic worksheets.

** Added documentation was found in the commentary process and we have added this to the External letter. This will be passed on to Laurel.

No conflict was found for the device and other than a comment on it being a well designed period device no problems were noted in commentary. This too will be passed up to Laurel.

12 Rustique de Suard (New Badge) Name registered April 1997 via Middle.

Purple on a bend counter embattles argent a heart fracted sable.

No conflict was found and no style or other problems were pointed out in commentary for the emblazon.. The blazon was changed from "Counter Embattled" to "Bretessed" and will be forwarded to Laurel.

13 Willem de Keirel (New Name and Device)
Seeking a male name with no preference of period or authenticity for sound meaning or language. **Will NOT accept major changes.

Quarterly azure and argent a winged wolf rampant sable.

Willem. Dutch Names 1358 -1361 Aryanhwy..
No documentation attached.

De Keirel

Copy of web document attached. www.mageologie.org/herreman/families/pafg74.htm.

** The noted documentation for the name Keirel comes from a personal Genealogy report and as such can not be supported for its accuracy or research level.

It was found that this was insufficient to support the submission and it will be returned for further documentation. As the name is being returned we have no choice but to pend the device at this time until the name is documented and put forward.

This then ends the letter of comment for this month. Comments or questions are welcome and as always I remain, In Service,

Percival de la Rocque
Green Mantle Herald